

MarinTrust RS V2.0



BYPRODUCT FISHERY ASSESSMENT TEMPLATE REPORT

MarinTrust Ltd, Unit C, Printworks, 22 Amelia Street, London, SE17 3BZ, United Kingdom

TABLE 1 APPLICATION DETAILS AND SUMMARY OF THE ASSESSMENT OUTCOME

Fishery Under Assessment	Species:	John Dory, <i>Zeus faber</i>
	Geographical area:	FAO 27 North East Atlantic
	Country of origin of the product:	France
	Stock:	Northeast Atlantic - Celtic sea, Western Channel and Northern Bay of Biscay (Divisions VIIe-j and VIII a,b) and the Western Iberian waters (Division IXa)
Date	September 2020	
Report Code	2020-120	
Assessor	Virginia Polonio	
Country of origin of the product - PASS	FRANCE	
Country of origin of the product - FAIL	NA	

Application details and summary of the assessment outcome			
Name:			
Address:			
Country: France		Zip:	
Tel. No.:		Fax. No.:	
Email address:		Applicant Code:	
Key Contact:		Title:	
Certification Body Details			
Name of Certification Body: SAI Global			
Assessor	Peer Reviewer	Assessment Days	Initial/Surveillance/ Re-approval
Virginia Polonio	Geraldine Criquet	0.5	SURV 1
Assessment Period		September 2020	

Scope Details	
Main Species	John Dory, <i>Zeus faber</i>
Stock	Celtic sea, Western Channel and Northern Bay of Biscay (Divisions VIIe-j and VIII a,b) and the Western Iberian waters (Division IXa)
Fishery Location	FAO 27 Northeast Atlantic Ocean
Management Authority (Country/ State)	Internationally; European union and domestic management; France
Gear Type(s)	Demersal trawls, seines, Gillnets, Beam trawls
Outcome of Assessment	
Peer Review Evaluation	Agree with determination
Recommendation	APPROVED

TABLE 2. ASSESSMENT DETERMINATION

Assessment Determination
<p>If any species is categorised as Endangered or Critically Endangered on IUCN’s Red List, or if it appears in the CITES appendices, it cannot be approved for use as IFFO RS raw material. John Dory (<i>Zeus faber</i>) do not appear as Endangered or Critically Endangered on IUCN’s Red List, nor do they appear in CITES appendices; therefore, cod is eligible for approval for use as IFFO RS by-product raw material.</p> <p>One stock complex forms part of this assessment: 1) <i>Zeus faber</i> in Celtic sea, Western Channel and Northern Bay of Biscay (Divisions VIIe-j and VIII a,b) and the Western Iberian waters (Division IXa).</p> <p>There are no management measures specifically implemented for the John Dory stock complex. The species is mainly caught in mixed fisheries. Catch-per-unit-effort (CPUE) series are available for this species.</p> <p>Therefore, following Marin Trust criteria, the species is assessed as Category D.</p> <p>Table D1 (PSA) has shown that the stock has an average productivity at 2.16 and the susceptibility at 2.2. The average for the PSA risk rating results that the species passes.</p> <p>Hence, John Dory in the area ICES Celtic sea, Western Channel and Northern Bay of Biscay (Divisions VIIe-j and VIII a,b) and the Western Iberian waters (Division IXa) is APPROVED by SAI Global assessors in the assessment area for the production of fishmeal and fish oil under the current IFFO RS v 2.0 by-products standard.</p>
Peer Review Comments
<p>Agree with determination.</p> <p>The peer reviewer agrees with the categorisation as Category D species, as there is no stock specific measures in place to manage this stock.</p> <p>The stock has been assessed under D1. The information related to the productivity and susceptibility is correct and the stock passes D1.</p>
Notes for On-site Auditor
Empty space for notes

SPECIES CATEGORISATION

NB: If any species is categorised as Endangered or Critically Endangered on the IUCN Red List, or if it appears in CITES Appendix 1, it **cannot** be approved for use as a MARINTRUST raw material.

IUCN Redlist Category

Byproduct material from a species listed by IUCN (the International Union for Conservation of Nature) under the Red List for the following categories shall immediately fail the assessment;

- EXTINCT (E) AND EXTINCT IN THE WILD (EW)
- CRITICALLY ENDANGERED (CR) facing an extremely high risk of extinction in the wild.
- ENDANGERED (EN) facing a very high risk of extinction in the wild.

Byproduct material may be used from the following categories provided that all clauses in the MarinTrust standard are passed.

- VULNERABLE (VU) facing a high risk of extinction in the wild.
- NEAR THREATENED (NT) does not qualify for above now, but is close or is likely to qualify for, a threatened category in the near future.
- LEAST CONCERN (LC) Widespread and abundant.
- DATA DEFICIENT (DD) and NOT EVALUATED (NE)

TABLE 3 SPECIES CATEGORISATION TABLE

Common name	Latin name	Stock	Management	Category	IUCN Red List Category ¹	CITES Appendix 1 ²
John Dory	<i>Zeus faber</i>	FAO 27 NE Atlantic ICES ICES Celtic sea, Western Channel and Northern Bay of Biscay (Divisions VIIe-j and VIII a,b) and the Western Iberian waters (Division IXa)	EU/Common Fisheries Policy	D	DD	No

¹ <https://www.iucnredlist.org/>

² <https://cites.org/eng/app/appendices.php>

CATEGORY D SPECIES

Category D species are those which make up less than 5% of landings and are not subject to a species-specific management regime. In the case of mixed trawl fisheries, Category D species may make up the majority of landings. The comparative lack of scientific information on the status of the population of the species means that

D1	Species Name	John Dory, <i>Zeus faber</i>	
	Productivity Attribute	Value	Score
	Average age at maturity (years)	4.3	3
	Average maximum age (years)	12	2
	Fecundity (eggs/spawning)	No estimation available	NA
	Average maximum size (cm)	90	2
	Average size at maturity (cm)	36.3	2
	Reproductive strategy	Non-guarders open water/substratum egg scatterers	1
	Mean trophic level	4.5	3
	Average Productivity Score		2.16
	Susceptibility Attribute	Value	Score
	Overlap of adult species range with fishery	NA	
	Distribution	Worldwide	1
	Habitat	Benthopelagic	2
	Depth range	50-150	3
	Selectivity	>2 times mesh size or up to 4 m	3
	Post-capture mortality	Alive after net hauled	2
	Average Susceptibility Score		2.2
	PSA Risk Rating (From Table D3)		PASS
	Compliance rating		PASS

References

Life History Data on *Zeus faber* Atlantic John Dory. Fishbase
<https://www.fishbase.de/summary/zeus-faber.html>
 Iwamoto, T. 2015. *Zeus faber*. The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species 2015:
 e.T198769A42390771. <https://dx.doi.org/10.2305/IUCN.UK.2015-4.RLTS.T198769A42390771.en>. Downloaded on 24
 September 2020

Standard clauses 1.3.2.2

a risk-assessment style approach must be taken.

Table D2 - Productivity / Susceptibility attributes and scores.

Productivity attributes	Low productivity/ High risk	Medium productivity/ Medium risk	High productivity/ Low risk
	Score 3	Score 2	Score 1
Average age at maturity (years)	>4	2 to 4	<2
Average maximum age (years)	>30	10 to 30	<10
Fecundity (eggs/spawning)	<1 000	1 000 to 10 000	>10 000
Average maximum size (cm)	>150	60 to 150	<60
Average size at maturity (cm)	>150	30 to 150	<30
Reproductive strategy	Live bearer, mouth brooder or significant parental investment	Demersal spawner "berried"	Broadcast spawner
Mean trophic level	>3.25	2.5–3.25	<2.5

Susceptibility attributes		High susceptibility/ High risk	Medium susceptibility/ Medium risk	Low susceptibility/ Low risk
		Score 3	Score 2	Score 1
Availability	1) Overlap of adult species range with fishery	>50% of stock occurs in the area fished	Between 25% and 50% of the stock occurs in the area fished	<25% of stock occurs in the area fished
	2) Distribution	Only in the country/ fishery	Limited range in the region	Throughout region/ global distribution
Encounterability	1) Habitat	Habitat preference of species make it highly likely to encounter trawl gear (e.g. demersal, muddy/sandy bottom)	Habitat preference of species make it moderately likely to encounter trawl gear (e.g. rocky bottom/reefs)	Depth or distribution of species make it unlikely to encounter trawl gear (e.g. epi-pelagic or meso-pelagic)
	2) Depth range	High overlap with trawl fishing gear (20 to 60 m depth)	Medium overlap with trawl fishing gear (10 to 20 m depth)	Low overlap with trawl fishing gear (0 to 10 m, >70 m depth)
Selectivity		Species >2 times mesh size or up to 4 m length	Species 1 to 2 times mesh size or 4 to 5 m length	Species <mesh size or >5 m length
Post capture mortality		Most dead or retained Trawl tow >3 hours	Alive after net hauled Trawl tow 0.5 to 3 hours	Released alive Trawl tow <0.5 hours

Note: Availability 2 is only used when there is no information for Availability 1; the most conservative score between Encounterability 1 and 2 is used.

D3		Average Susceptibility Score		
		1 - 1.75	1.76 - 2.24	2.25 - 3
Average Productivity Score	1 - 1.75	PASS	PASS	PASS
	1.76 - 2.24	PASS	PASS	TABLE D4
	2.25 - 3	PASS	TABLE D4	TABLE D4

SOCIAL CRITERION

In addition to the scored criteria listed above, applicants must commit to ensuring that vessels operating in the fishery adhere to internationally recognised guidance on human rights. They must also commit to ensuring there is no use of enforced or unpaid labour in the fleet(s) operating upon the resource.

Appendix A - Determining Resilience Ratings

The assessment of Category B species described in this assessment report template utilises a resilience rating system suggested by the American Fisheries Society. This approach was chosen because it is also used by FishBase, and so the resilience ratings for many thousands of species are freely available online. As described by FishBase, the following is the process used to arrive at the resilience ratings:

“The American Fisheries Society (AFS) has suggested values for several biological parameters that allow classification of a fish population or species into categories of high, medium, low and very low resilience or productivity (Musick 1999). If no reliable estimate of r_m (see below) is available, the assignment is to the lowest category for which any of the available parameters fits. For each of these categories, AFS has suggested thresholds for decline over the longer of 10 years or three generations. If an observed decline measured in biomass or numbers of mature individuals exceeds the indicated threshold value, the population or species is considered vulnerable to extinction unless explicitly shown otherwise. If one sex strongly limits the reproductive capacity of the species or population, then only the decline in the limiting sex should be considered. We decided to restrict the automatic assignment of resilience categories in the Key Facts page to values of K , t_m and t_{max} and those records of fecundity estimates that referred to minimum number of eggs or pups per female per year, assuming that these were equivalent to average fecundity at first maturity (Musick 1999). Note that many small fishes may spawn several times per year (we exclude these for the time being) and large live bearers such as the coelacanth may have gestation periods of more than one year (we corrected fecundity estimates for those cases reported in the literature). Also, we excluded resilience estimates based on r_m (see below) as we are not yet confident with the reliability of the current method for estimating r_m . If users have independent r_m or fecundity estimates, they can refer to Table 1 for using this information.”

Parameter	High	Medium	Low	Very low
Threshold	0.99	0.95	0.85	0.70
r_{max} (1/year)	> 0.5	0.16 - 0.50	0.05 - 0.15	< 0.05
K (1/year)	> 0.3	0.16 - 0.30	0.05 - 0.15	< 0.05
Fecundity (1/year)	> 10,000	100 - 1000	10 - 100	< 10

t_m (years)	< 1	2 - 4	5 - 10	> 10
t_{max} (years)	1 - 3	4 - 10	11 - 30	> 30

[Taken from the FishBase manual, "Estimation of Life-History Key Facts",
<http://www.fishbase.us/manual/English/key%20facts.htm#resilience>]

Appendix B: From MARINTRUST Standard V2.0 Annex 2: Fish By-product Assessment Methodology

Definition of a Fish By-product

A by-product is a useful and marketable product that is not the primary product being produced. A marketable by-product is from a process that can technically not be avoided. This includes materials that may be traditionally defined as waste such as industrial scrap that is subsequently used as a raw material in a different manufacturing process.

"Fish By-products" refers to commodities that are manufactured from fish, including shellfish, and crustaceans in a form that is different than conventional foods and which are intended for human consumption (either directly or as a food ingredient). Fish By-products include, but are not limited to:

- By-products derived from fish, including fish cartilage, fish oils, and fish proteins; and
- By-products derived from the carapaces of crustaceans; but do not include marine plants or marine plant products.

(Canadian Food Inspection Agency Definition)

In addition, a whole fish which is rejected on an intrinsic quality ground e.g. does not meet the specification for human consumption due to physical damage or the quality is substandard. These whole fish shall in these cases be classified as a by-product from the human consumption fishery, and can be used for marine ingredients production.

A whole catch of fish that is rejected by a fish processing factory on economic grounds is not considered to be a fish by-product. This fish can only be used for marine ingredients production if the fishery has been assessed and approved under the requirements of the IFFO Responsible Sourcing Standard.

Why utilise Fish By-products?

FAO Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries

General Principles Article 6

6.7 The harvesting, handling, processing and distribution of fish and fishery products should be carried out in a manner which will maintain the nutritional value, quality and safety of the products, reduce waste and minimize negative impacts on the environment.

Responsible fish utilisation Article 11.1

11.1.8 States should encourage those involved in fish processing, distribution and marketing to reduce post-harvest losses and waste.

Benefits of Including Fish By-Products in the MARINTRUST Standard:

1. Improved fish resource utilisation

2. Reduction in waste for nutritional value
3. 35% of fish by-products are currently used to make quality fishmeal and oil
4. Excellent Economic return
5. Better compliance with FAO Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries

What Fish By-products cannot be used?

1. IUCN

Fishery By-products shall Not be taken from a species listed by IUCN (the International Union for Conservation of Nature) under the Red List for certain categories;

- EXTINCT (E) AND EXTINCT IN THE WILD (EW)
- CRITICALLY ENDANGERED (CR) facing an extremely high risk of extinction in the wild.
- ENDANGERED (EN) facing a very high risk of extinction in the wild.

Fish By-product material may be used from the vulnerable category, but it shall incur a fishery surveillance conducted by the certification body prior to it being included in the scope of this standard.

- VULNERABLE (VU) facing a high risk of extinction in the wild.

The Fish By-product material from these species will be acceptable for use in the scope of this standard;

- NEAR THREATENED (NT) does not qualify for above now, but is close or is likely to qualify for, a threatened category in the near future.
- LEAST CONCERN (LC) Widespread and abundant.

Fish By-product material may be used from the following category, but it shall incur a fishery surveillance prior to it being included in the scope of this standard;

- DATA DEFICIENT (DD) and NOT EVALUATED (NE)

The fishery surveillance conducted by the certification body will review the following areas:

Stock Assessment

- From a recognised Institution
- Fisheries are recognised as legal
- Fisheries do not contradict scientific opinion

2. FAO Code of Conduct for Responsible Fisheries

In addition the Fish By-products shall not come from fisheries that do not comply with the following criteria;

1. Fisheries should prohibit dynamiting, poisoning and other comparable destructive fishing practices.
2. Fishery material shall not be from IUU fishing activity nor sourced from vessels officially listed as engaging in illegal, unreported and unregulated (IUU) fishing activity.

Sources of Information

1. Food Standards Agency
2. Canadian Food Inspection Agency
3. DEFRA
4. GAA Feed mill BAP standard
5. EU Commission
6. IUCN